



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_3536
Title of the Manuscript:	The effect of macro and micronutrient fertilizers on the growth and yield of rice under calcareous soils

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	- Ambiguous description about experiment. It is insisted for addition of photograph or schematic diagram. - Review of results are not scientific. It is not obvious the results which could be contributed to field application. It is not shown the specific correlation between macro- or micronutrients and rice yield. - The results showed in this study is looked very general ones but not distinguishing results.	- Ok. I will add the schematic diagram in the text (methodology). - At conclusion and abstract parts, it was shown that treatment no.17 (when NPK+ S + Zn-sulfate fertilizers applied together) is the best treatment at the present study which can be recommended to field application. -Yes, you're right. The use of micro nutrient fertilizers in the field are routine methods but; the use of sulfur powder and the use of all micronutrient fertilizers are not recommended on the field especially paddy field. Some of micronutrients are essential and some ones are not needed under water-logged conditions (it should be investigated). On the other hand, the cultivation of the rice plant under calcareous soils are not recommended and its growth will be influenced by soil pH, extra CaCO₃ and etc., which will be caused decreasing rice grain yield. The soil pH of the most of arable soils and also paddy field soils have been varied (increased) on



SDI Review Form 1.6

		the world. It is because of extra using of P-fertilizers, plant cultivation on the same farm continuously, etc. Thus, we must examine that how the soil pH decrease under calcareous and alkaline soils? At the present study, it was showed and concluded that the yield and yield components of rice plant were increased when the soil pH decreased by using Zn-fertilizer (amongst other micronutrients) and S powder under calcareous soils. It shows that there is no needed to use other micronutrients which is also benefit for farmers economically.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		